

**2021 TRI-COMMUNITY
NON-MOTORIZED TRAIL COMMITTEE AGENDA SPECIAL MEETING
FRIDAY, MARCH 5, 2021 – 2:00 P.M.**

- 1. CALL TO ORDER**
- 2. ROLL CALL**
- 3. APPROVAL OF AGENDA**
- 4. PUBLIC COMMENTS/TODAY'S AGENDA TOPICS ONLY (LIMIT 3 MINUTES)** *Use the "raise hand" button in the participant's screen found in the Zoom interface or enter *9 if calling in by phone to raise hand.*
- 5. REVIEW ENGINEERING PROPOSALS - UTILIZING RANKING TOOL, COMPARISON SHEET & COMMITTEE DISCUSSION**
- 6. VOTE FOR TWO ENGINEERING FIRMS TO INTERVIEW**
- 7. REVIEW NEXT STEPS**
- 8. PUBLIC COMMENTS (LIMIT 3 MINUTES)** *Use the "raise hand" button in the participant's screen found in the Zoom interface or enter *9 if calling in by phone to raise hand.*
- 9. MEMBER CLOSING COMMENTS**

NOTICE:

This public meeting will be held using Zoom video/audio conference technology due to the COVID-19 restrictions currently in place.

Join online by visiting:
<https://us02web.zoom.us/j/2698572603>

Join by phone by dialing:
**(312) 626-6799 -or-
(646) 518-9805**

Then enter "Meeting ID":
2698572603

Please send questions or comments regarding meeting agenda items prior to meeting to:
hleo@saugatuckcity.com

BLUE STAR TRAIL-NORTH SECTION												
EVALUATION OF ENGINEERING FIRM PROPOSALS TO SELECT TWO FINALISTS												
2/23/21												
Rank order 1-4 (1 is top rank) each Bidder against each criteria.												
If equal, use same score; e.g. all equal score 1, 1, 1, 1; three are equal, 1, 2, 1, 1, etc.												
Evaluation Criteria	Bidder	Weight	C2AE	Beckett Raeder	Moore Bruggink	Wightman	Weighted Score	C2AE	Beckett Raeder	Moore Bruggink	Wightman	Notes/Questions
R	Requirements											
R1.1	Firm services provided and relevance to this project	2.5%	1	1	2	1	0.03	0.03	0.05	0.03		
R1.2	Description of proposed Project Team Roles & Responsibilities	2.5%	1	2	1	1	0.03	0.05	0.03	0.03		
R2.1	Experience of Project Manager	20.0%	1	1	2	3	0.20	0.20	0.40	0.60		
R2.2	Experience of Landscape Architect	5.0%	2	1	2	3	0.10	0.05	0.10	0.15		
R2.3	Experience of Traffic Engineer	15.0%	1	1	1	1	0.15	0.15	0.15	0.15		
R3.1	Experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope	7.5%	1	1	2	1	0.08	0.08	0.15	0.08		
R3.2	Tools examples provided: project budget examples, cost estimate examples, results (contact references to validate)	2.5%	2	2	1	2	0.05	0.05	0.03	0.05		
R3.3	Firm prequalified with MDOT for pertinent scope of work	2.5%	1	1	1	1	0.03	0.03	0.03	0.03		
R4	Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/ construction, inspection/quality control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC, communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc).	10.0%	1	1	2	1	0.10	0.10	0.20	0.10		See 'Specific Tasks' of Section II
R5	Estimate of overall cost of service for project	10.0%	1	2	1	2	0.10	0.20	0.10	0.20		
R6	Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants.	7.5%	1	1	2	2	0.08	0.08	0.15	0.15		
R7	Familiarity and experience in project work in proximity to S-D, including working with MDOT and Allegan County Road Commission	2.5%	1	2	3	4	0.03	0.05	0.08	0.10		Is part of this getting at current relationships/contacts?
R8	Experience in working with a Fire or Police Department in the design of a road or trail	2.5%	2	1	1	1	0.05	0.03	0.03	0.03		
R9	Experience with 'smart traffic signals' that are remotely controlled	2.5%	2	1	1	1	0.05	0.03	0.03	0.03		
R10	Evaluation of references provided for similar projects	5.0%	1	1	2	1	0.05	0.05	0.10	0.05		
R11	Evaluation of Contract Form	2.5%	2	1	2	3	0.05	0.03	0.05	0.08		Is it comprehensive, is it clear, is it fair to both parties
		100.0%	1.313	1.250	1.625	1.750	1.150	1.175	1.650	1.825		
R12	Other Information Provided											Use to help evaluate R1 - R11 as appropriate, use as tie-breaker, use to generate interview questions
RFP Evaluation Criteria Categories												
	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs	100.0%					1.15	1.175	1.65	1.825		
			C2AE	Beckett Raeder	Moore Bruggink	Wightman	C2AE	Beckett Raeder	Moore Bruggink	Wightman		
R1.2	Description of proposed Project Team Roles & Responsibilities	2.5%	1	2	1	1	0.025	0.05	0.025	0.025		
R2.1	Experience of Project Manager	20.0%	1	1	2	3	0.2	0.2	0.4	0.6		
R2.2	Experience of Landscape Architect	5.0%	2	1	2	3	0.1	0.05	0.1	0.15		
R2.3	Experience of Traffic Engineer	15.0%	1	1	1	1	0.15	0.15	0.15	0.15		
R4	Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/ construction, inspection/quality control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC, communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc).	10.0%	1	1	2	1	0.1	0.1	0.2	0.1		
R6	Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants.	7.5%	1	1	2	2	0.075	0.075	0.15	0.15		
R9	Experience with 'smart traffic signals' that are remotely controlled	2.5%	2	1	1	1	0.05	0.025	0.025	0.025		
	Technical Weighting	62.5%					0.7	0.65	1.05	1.2		
							Technical Rank					
	Price - project cost, life-cycle cost											
R5	Estimate of overall cost of service for project	10.0%	1	2	1	2	0.1	0.2	0.1	0.2		
							Price Rank					
	Management - features or qualities of bidder as an organization (e.g., management approach, capacity to deliver, interest, financial capacity, business size & type, proprietary rights, references of past performance)											
R1.1	Firm services provided and relevance to this project	2.5%	1	1	2	1	0.025	0.025	0.05	0.025		
R3.1	Experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope	7.5%	1	1	2	1	0.075	0.075	0.15	0.075		
R3.2	Tools examples provided: project budget examples, cost estimate examples, results (contact references to validate)	2.5%	2	2	1	2	0.05	0.05	0.025	0.05		
R3.3	Firm prequalified with MDOT for pertinent scope of work	2.5%	1	1	1	1	0.025	0.025	0.025	0.025		
R7	Familiarity and experience in project work in proximity to S-D, including working with MDOT and Allegan County Road Commission	2.5%	1	2	3	4	0.025	0.05	0.075	0.1		
R8	Experience in working with a Fire or Police Department in the design of a road or trail	2.5%	2	1	1	1	0.05	0.025	0.025	0.025		
R10	Evaluation of references provided for similar projects	5.0%	1	1	2	1	0.05	0.05	0.1	0.05		
R11	Evaluation of Contract Form	2.5%	2	1	2	3	0.05	0.025	0.05	0.075		
	Management Weighting	27.5%					0.35	0.325	0.5	0.425		
							Management Rank					

Kathy Mooradian

BLUE STAR TRAIL-NORTH SECTION

EVALUATION OF ENGINEERING FIRM PROPOSALS TO SELECT TWO FINALISTS

Criteria Categories

Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs

		Weight
1	Firm Experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	10.0%
2	Project leader experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	20.0%
3	Landscape Arcitect experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	10.0%
4	Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants.	20.0%
5	Experience with multi-jurisdiction projects	5.0%
6	Traffic Engineer Experience	5.0%
7	Experience in workng with a Fire or Police Department in the design of a road or trail	5.0%
	Technical Weighting	75.0%

Management - features or qualities of bidder as an organization (e.g., management approach, capacity to deliver, interest, finanacial capacity, business size & type, proprietary rights, references of past performance)

Weight

8	Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/construction, inspection/quality control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC, communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc).	20.0%
9	Familiarity and experience in project work in proximity to S-D, including working with MDOT and Allegan County Road Commission	5.0%
	Management Weighting	25.0%
	TOTAL SCORE	100.0%

1-Mar-21

Rank order 1-4 each Bidder against each criteria (1 is top rank).

If equal, use same score; e.g. all equal score 1, 1, 1, 1; three are equal, 1, 2, 1, 1, etc.

<u>C2AE</u>	<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>	Weighted Score <u>C2AE</u>
1.00	2.00	1.00	2.00	0.100
1.00	2.00	1.00	3.00	0.200
1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	0.100
1.00	2.00	1.00	1.00	0.200
1.00	2.00	1.00	1.00	0.050
3.00	2.00	2.00	1.00	0.150
1.00	2.00	2.00	2.00	0.050

0.85

1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00
2.00	3.00	1.00	1.00

0.20

0.10

0.30

1.15

<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>	<u>Notes/Questions</u>
0.200	0.100	0.200	
0.400	0.200	0.600	
0.100	0.100	0.100	
0.400	0.200	0.200	
0.100	0.050	0.050	
0.100	0.100	0.050	
0.100	0.100	0.100	
1.40	0.85	1.30	

0.20

0.20

0.20

0.15

0.05

0.05

0.35

0.25

0.25

1.75

1.10

1.55

Jerry Donovan

BLUE STAR TRAIL-NORTH SECTION

EVALUATION OF ENGINEERING FIRM PROPOSALS TO SELECT TWO FINALISTS

Criteria Categories

Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs

		Weight
1	Firm Experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	10.0%
2	Project leader experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	20.0%
3	Landscape Arcitect experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	10.0%
4	Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants.	20.0%
5	Experience with multi-jurisdiction projects	5.0%
6	Traffic Engineer Experience	5.0%
7	Experience in workng with a Fire or Police Department in the design of a road or trail	5.0%
	Technical Weighting	75.0%

Management - features or qualities of bidder as an organization (e.g., management approach, capacity to deliver, interest, finanacial capacity, business size & type, proprietary rights, references of past performance)

		Weight
8	Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/construction, inspection/quality control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC, communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc).	20.0%

9	Familiarity and experience in project work in proximity to S-D, including working with MDOT and Allegan County Road Commission	5.0%
---	--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	------

	Management Weighting	25.0%
--	-----------------------------	--------------

	TOTAL SCORE	100.0%
--	--------------------	---------------

1-Mar-21

Rank order 1-4 each Bidder against each criteria (1 is top rank).

If equal, use same score; e.g. all equal score 1, 1, 1, 1; three are equal, 1, 2, 1, 1, etc.

<u>C2AE</u>	<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>	Weighted Score <u>C2AE</u>
1.00	3.00	2.00	2.00	0.100
1.00	3.00	2.00	2.00	0.200
2.00	2.00	2.00	2.00	0.200
2.00	3.00	2.00	2.00	0.400
2.00	3.00	2.00	2.00	0.100
2.00	3.00	2.00	2.00	0.100
1.00	3.00	2.00	2.00	0.050

1.15

1.00	2.00	2.00	2.00	0.20
------	------	------	------	------

2.00	3.00	2.00	2.00
------	------	------	------

0.10

0.30

1.45

1

<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>	<u>Notes/Questions</u>
-----------------------	-----------------------	-----------------	------------------------

0.300	0.200	0.200	
-------	-------	-------	--

0.600	0.400	0.400	
-------	-------	-------	--

0.200	0.200	0.200	
-------	-------	-------	--

0.600	0.400	0.400	
-------	-------	-------	--

0.150	0.100	0.100	
-------	-------	-------	--

0.150	0.100	0.100	
-------	-------	-------	--

0.150	0.100	0.100	
-------	-------	-------	--

2.15			
-------------	--	--	--

	1.50		
--	-------------	--	--

		1.50	
--	--	-------------	--

0.40			
------	--	--	--

	0.40		
--	------	--	--

		0.40	
--	--	------	--

0.15

0.10

0.10

0.55

0.50

0.50

2.70

2.00

2.00

3

2

2

Brenda Marcy

BLUE STAR TRAIL-NORTH SECTION

EVALUATION OF ENGINEERING FIRM PROPOSALS TO SELECT TWO FINALISTS

Criteria Categories

Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs

		Weight
1	Firm Experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	10.0%
2	Project leader experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	20.0%
3	Landscape Arcitect experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	10.0%
4	Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants.	20.0%
5	Experience with multi-jurisdiction projects	5.0%
6	Traffic Engineer Experience	5.0%
7	Experience in workng with a Fire or Police Department in the design of a road or trail	5.0%
	Technical Weighting	75.0%

Management - features or qualities of bidder as an organization (e.g., management approach, capacity to deliver, interest, finanacial capacity, business size & type, proprietary rights, references of past performance)

Weight

8	Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/construction, inspection/quality control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC, communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc).	20.0%
9	Familiarity and experience in project work in proximity to S-D, including working with MDOT and Allegan County Road Commission	5.0%

Management Weighting 25.0%

TOTAL SCORE 100.0%

1-Mar-21

Rank order 1-4 each Bidder against each criteria (1 is top rank).

If equal, use same score; e.g. all equal score 1, 1, 1, 1; three are equal, 1, 2, 1, 1, etc.

<u>C2AE</u>	<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>	Weighted Score <u>C2AE</u>
1.00	4.00	3.00	2.00	0.100
1.00	3.00	2.00	2.00	0.200
1.00	4.00	2.00	2.00	0.100
1.00	2.00	2.00	1.00	0.200
1.00	4.00	2.00	1.00	0.050
1.00	2.00	2.00	4.00	0.050
1.00	3.00	2.00	4.00	0.050

0.75

1.00	4.00	2.00	3.00
1.00	4.00	4.00	1.00

0.20

0.05

0.25

1.00

<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>	<u>Notes/Questions</u>
0.400	0.300	0.200	
0.600	0.400	0.400	
0.400	0.200	0.200	
0.400	0.400	0.200	
0.200	0.100	0.050	
0.100	0.100	0.200	
0.150	0.100	0.200	
2.25	1.60	1.45	

0.80

0.40

0.60

0.20

0.20

0.05

1.00

0.60

0.65

3.25

2.20

2.10

Cindy Osman

BLUE STAR TRAIL-NORTH SECTION

EVALUATION OF ENGINEERING FIRM PROPOSALS TO SELECT TWO FINALISTS

Criteria Categories

Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs

		Weight
1	Firm Experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	10.0%
2	Project leader experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	20.0%
3	Landscape Arcitect experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	10.0%
4	Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants.	20.0%
5	Experience with multi-jurisdiction projects	5.0%
6	Traffic Engineer Experience	5.0%
7	Experience in workng with a Fire or Police Department in the design of a road or trail	5.0%
	Technical Weighting	75.0%

Management - features or qualities of bidder as an organization (e.g., management approach, capacity to deliver, interest, finanacial capacity, business size & type, proprietary rights, references of past performance)

Weight

8	Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/construction, inspection/quality control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC, communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc).	20.0%
9	Familiarity and experience in project work in proximity to S-D, including working with MDOT and Allegan County Road Commission	5.0%
Management Weighting		25.0%
TOTAL SCORE		100.0%

1-Mar-21

Rank order 1-4 each Bidder against each criteria (1 is top rank).

If equal, use same score; e.g. all equal score 1, 1, 1, 1; three are equal, 1, 2, 1, 1, etc.

<u>C2AE</u>	<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>	Weighted Score <u>C2AE</u>
1.00	2.00	1.00	1.00	0.100
1.00	2.00	1.00	1.00	0.200
1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	0.100
1.00	2.00	1.00	1.00	0.200
1.00	2.00	2.00	1.00	0.050
1.00	4.00	1.00	1.00	0.050
1.00	2.00	2.00	1.00	0.050

0.75

1.00	2.00	1.00	1.00
1.00	3.00	2.00	1.00

0.20

0.05

0.25

1.00

<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>	<u>Notes/Questions</u>
0.200	0.100	0.100	
0.400	0.200	0.200	
0.100	0.100	0.100	
0.400	0.200	0.200	
0.100	0.100	0.050	
0.200	0.050	0.050	
0.100	0.100	0.050	
1.50	0.85	0.75	

0.40

0.20

0.20

0.15

0.10

0.05

0.55

0.30

0.25

2.05

1.15

1.00

Holly Leo

BLUE STAR TRAIL-NORTH SECTION

EVALUATION OF ENGINEERING FIRM PROPOSALS TO SELECT TWO FINALISTS

Criteria Categories

Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs

Weight

1	Firm Experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	10.0%
2	Project leader experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	20.0%
3	Landscape Arcitect experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	10.0%
4	Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants.	20.0%
5	Experience with multi-jurisdiction projects	5.0%
6	Traffic Engineer Experience	5.0%
7	Experience in workng with a Fire or Police Department in the design of a road or trail	5.0%

Technical Weighting 75.0%

Management - features or qualities of bidder as an organization (e.g., management approach, capacity to deliver, interest, finanacial capacity, business size & type, proprietary rights, references of past performance)

Weight

8	Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/construction, inspection/quality control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC, communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc).	20.0%
9	Familiarity and experience in project work in proximity to S-D, including working with MDOT and Allegan County Road Commission	5.0%
	Management Weighting	25.0%
	TOTAL SCORE	100.0%

1-Mar-21

Rank order 1-4 each Bidder against each criteria (1 is top rank).

If equal, use same score; e.g. all equal score 1, 1, 1, 1; three are equal, 1, 2, 1, 1, etc.

<u>C2AE</u>	<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>	Weighted Score <u>C2AE</u>
1.00	4.00	3.00	2.00	0.100
1.00	4.00	4.00	3.00	0.200
2.00	3.00	3.00	2.00	0.200
1.00	4.00	3.00	2.00	0.200
1.00	4.00	4.00	2.00	0.050
1.00	4.00	3.00	1.00	0.050
1.00	4.00	3.00	2.00	0.050

0.85

1.00	4.00	2.00	2.00
2.00	4.00	3.00	1.00

0.20

0.10

0.30

1.15

<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>	<u>Notes/Questions</u>
0.400	0.300	0.200	
0.800	0.800	0.600	
0.300	0.300	0.200	
0.800	0.600	0.400	
0.200	0.200	0.100	
0.200	0.150	0.050	
0.200	0.150	0.100	
2.90	2.50	1.65	

0.80

0.40

0.40

0.20

0.15

0.05

1.00

0.55

0.45

3.90

3.05

2.10

Ken Trester

BLUE STAR TRAIL-NORTH SECTION

EVALUATION OF ENGINEERING FIRM PROPOSALS TO SELECT TWO FINALISTS

Criteria Categories

Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs

		Weight
1	Firm Experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	10.0%
2	Project leader experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	20.0%
3	Landscape Arcitect experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	10.0%
4	Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants.	20.0%
5	Experience with multi-jurisdiction projects	5.0%
6	Traffic Engineer Experience	5.0%
7	Experience in workng with a Fire or Police Department in the design of a road or trail	5.0%
	Technical Weighting	75.0%

Management - features or qualities of bidder as an organization (e.g., management approach, capacity to deliver, interest, finanacial capacity, business size & type, proprietary rights, references of past performance)

Weight

8	Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/construction, inspection/quality control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC, communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc).	20.0%
9	Familiarity and experience in project work in proximity to S-D, including working with MDOT and Allegan County Road Commission	5.0%
Management Weighting		25.0%
TOTAL SCORE		100.0%

1-Mar-21

Rank order 1-4 each Bidder against each criteria (1 is top rank).

If equal, use same score; e.g. all equal score 1, 1, 1, 1; three are equal, 1, 2, 1, 1, etc.

<u>C2AE</u>	<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>	Weighted Score <u>C2AE</u>
1.00	2.00	1.00	1.00	0.100
1.00	1.00	1.00	4.00	0.200
1.00	1.00	4.00	1.00	0.100
1.00	3.00	1.00	2.00	0.200
1.00	4.00	2.00	1.00	0.050
4.00	4.00	3.00	4.00	0.200
1.00	4.00	4.00	2.00	0.050

0.90

1.00	1.00	2.00	2.00
1.00	3.00	3.00	1.00

0.20

0.05

0.25

1.15

<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>	<u>Notes/Questions</u>
0.200	0.100	0.100	
0.200	0.200	0.800	
0.100	0.400	0.100	
0.600	0.200	0.400	
0.200	0.100	0.050	
0.200	0.150	0.200	
0.200	0.200	0.100	
1.70	1.35	1.75	

0.20

0.40

0.40

0.15

0.15

0.05

0.35

0.55

0.45

2.05

1.90

2.20

Rich LaBombard

BLUE STAR TRAIL-NORTH SECTION

EVALUATION OF ENGINEERING FIRM PROPOSALS TO SELECT TWO FINALISTS

Criteria Categories

Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs

		Weight
1	Firm Experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	10.0%
2	Project leader experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	20.0%
3	Landscape Arcitect experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	10.0%
4	Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants.	20.0%
5	Experience with multi-jurisdiction projects	5.0%
6	Traffic Engineer Experience	5.0%
7	Experience in workng with a Fire or Police Department in the design of a road or trail	5.0%
	Technical Weighting	75.0%

Management - features or qualities of bidder as an organization (e.g., management approach, capacity to deliver, interest, finanacial capacity, business size & type, proprietary rights, references of past performance)

Weight

8	Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/construction, inspection/quality control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC, communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc).	20.0%
9	Familiarity and experience in project work in proximity to S-D, including working with MDOT and Allegan County Road Commission	5.0%
	Management Weighting	25.0%
	TOTAL SCORE	100.0%

1-Mar-21

Rank order 1-4 each Bidder against each criteria (1 is top rank).

If equal, use same score; e.g. all equal score 1, 1, 1, 1; three are equal, 1, 2, 1, 1, etc.

<u>C2AE</u>	<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>	Weighted Score <u>C2AE</u>
				0.000
				0.000
				0.000
				0.000
				0.000
				0.000
				0.000

0.00

0.00

0.00

0.00

0.00

<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>	<u>Notes/Questions</u>
0.000	0.000	0.000	
0.000	0.000	0.000	
0.000	0.000	0.000	
0.000	0.000	0.000	
0.000	0.000	0.000	
0.000	0.000	0.000	
0.000	0.000	0.000	
0.00	0.00	0.00	

0.00

0.00

0.00

0.00

0.00

0.00

0.00

0.00

0.00

0.00

0.00

0.00

Joe Frey

BLUE STAR TRAIL-NORTH SECTION

EVALUATION OF ENGINEERING FIRM PROPOSALS TO SELECT TWO FINALISTS

Criteria Categories

Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs

Weight

1	Firm Experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	10.0%
2	Project leader experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	20.0%
3	Landscape Arcitect experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	10.0%
4	Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants.	20.0%
5	Experience with multi-jurisdiction projects	5.0%
6	Traffic Engineer Experience	5.0%
7	Experience in workng with a Fire or Police Department in the design of a road or trail	5.0%

Technical Weighting 75.0%

Management - features or qualities of bidder as an organization (e.g., management approach, capacity to deliver, interest, finanacial capacity, business size & type, proprietary rights, references of past performance)

Weight

8	Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/construction, inspection/quality control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC, communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc).	20.0%
9	Familiarity and experience in project work in proximity to S-D, including working with MDOT and Allegan County Road Commission	5.0%
	Management Weighting	25.0%
	TOTAL SCORE	100.0%

1-Mar-21

Rank order 1-4 each Bidder against each criteria (1 is top rank).

If equal, use same score; e.g. all equal score 1, 1, 1, 1; three are equal, 1, 2, 1, 1, etc.

<u>C2AE</u>	<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>	Weighted Score <u>C2AE</u>
				0.000
				0.000
				0.000
				0.000
				0.000
				0.000
				0.000

0.00

0.00

0.00

0.00

0.00

<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>	<u>Notes/Questions</u>
0.000	0.000	0.000	
0.000	0.000	0.000	
0.000	0.000	0.000	
0.000	0.000	0.000	
0.000	0.000	0.000	
0.000	0.000	0.000	
0.000	0.000	0.000	
0.00	0.00	0.00	

0.00

0.00

0.00

0.00

0.00

0.00

0.00

0.00

0.00

0.00

0.00

0.00

Ryan Heise

**BLUE STAR TRAIL-NORTH SECTION
EVALUATION OF ENGINEERING FIRM PROPOSALS TO SELECT TWO FINALISTS**

Criteria Categories

Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs

		Weight
1	Firm Experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	10.0%
2	Project leader experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	20.0%
3	Landscape Arcitect experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	10.0%
4	Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants.	20.0%
5	Experience with multi-jurisdiction projects	5.0%
6	Traffic Engineer Experience	5.0%
7	Experience in workng with a Fire or Police Department in the design of a road or trail	5.0%
	Technical Weighting	75.0%

Management - features or qualities of bidder as an organization (e.g., management approach, capacity to deliver, interest, finanacial capacity, business size & type, proprietary rights, references of past performance)

Weight

8	Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/construction, inspection/quality control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC, communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc).	20.0%
9	Familiarity and experience in project work in proximity to S-D, including working with MDOT and Allegan County Road Commission	5.0%
	Management Weighting	25.0%
	TOTAL SCORE	100.0%

1-Mar-21

Rank order 1-4 each Bidder against each criteria (1 is top rank).

If equal, use same score; e.g. all equal score 1, 1, 1, 1; three are equal, 1, 2, 1, 1, etc.

<u>C2AE</u>	<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>	Weighted Score <u>C2AE</u>
				0.000
				0.000
				0.000
				0.000
				0.000
				0.000
				0.000

0.00

0.00

0.00

0.00

0.00

<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>	<u>Notes/Questions</u>
0.000	0.000	0.000	
0.000	0.000	0.000	
0.000	0.000	0.000	
0.000	0.000	0.000	
0.000	0.000	0.000	
0.000	0.000	0.000	
0.000	0.000	0.000	
0.00	0.00	0.00	

0.00

0.00

0.00

0.00

0.00

0.00

0.00

0.00

0.00

0.00

0.00

0.00

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

Richard Donovan

BLUE STAR TRAIL-NORTH SECTION

EVALUATION OF ENGINEERING FIRM PROPOSALS TO SELECT TWO FINALISTS

Criteria Categories

Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs

Firm Experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)

Project leader experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)

Landscape Arcitect experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)

Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants.

Experience with multi-jurisdiction projects

Traffic Engineer Experience

Experience in workng with a Fire or Police Department in the design of a road or trail

Technical Weighting

Management - features or qualities of bidder as an organization (e.g., management approach, capacity to deliver, interest, finanacial capacity, business size & type, proprietary rights, references of past performance)

Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/construction, inspection/quality control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC, communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc).

Familiarity and experience in project work in proximity to S-D, including working with MDOT and Allegan County Road Commission

Management Weighting

TOTAL SCORE

1-Mar-21

**Rank order 1-4 each Bidder against each criteria (1 is top rank).
If equal, use same score; e.g. all equal score 1, 1, 1, 1; three are equal**

Weight	<u>C2AE</u>	<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>
10.0%	1.00	4.00	3.00
20.0%	1.00	4.00	4.00
10.0%	2.00	3.00	4.00
20.0%	1.00	4.00	3.00
5.0%	1.00	4.00	4.00
5.0%	1.00	4.00	3.00
5.0%	1.00	4.00	3.00

75.0%

Weight

20.0%	1.00	4.00	2.00
5.0%	2.00	4.00	2.00

25.0%

100.0%

1, 1, 2, 1, 1, etc.

Weighted Score

<u>Wightman</u>	<u>C2AE</u>	<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>
2.00	0.100	0.400	0.300
3.00	0.200	0.800	0.800
3.00	0.200	0.300	0.400
3.00	0.200	0.800	0.600
3.00	0.050	0.200	0.200
4.00	0.050	0.200	0.150
3.00	0.050	0.200	0.150



2.00	0.20	0.80	0.40
1.00	0.10	0.20	0.10



Wightman

Notes/Questions

0.200

0.600

0.300

0.600

0.150

0.200

0.150

2.20

0.40

0.05

0.45

2.65

John Adams

BLUE STAR TRAIL-NORTH SECTION

EVALUATION OF ENGINEERING FIRM PROPOSALS TO SELECT TWO FINALISTS

Criteria Categories

Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs

		Weight
1	Firm Experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	10.0%
2	Project leader experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	20.0%
3	Landscape Arcitect experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	10.0%
4	Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants.	20.0%
5	Experience with multi-jurisdiction projects	5.0%
6	Traffic Engineer Experience	5.0%
7	Experience in workng with a Fire or Police Department in the design of a road or trail	5.0%
	Technical Weighting	75.0%

Management - features or qualities of bidder as an organization (e.g., management approach, capacity to deliver, interest, finanacial capacity, business size & type, proprietary rights, references of past performance)

Weight

8	Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/construction, inspection/quality control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC, communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc).	20.0%
9	Familiarity and experience in project work in proximity to S-D, including working with MDOT and Allegan County Road Commission	5.0%
	Management Weighting	25.0%
	TOTAL SCORE	100.0%

1-Mar-21

Rank order 1-4 each Bidder against each criteria (1 is top rank).

If equal, use same score; e.g. all equal score 1, 1, 1, 1; three are equal, 1, 2, 1, 1, etc.

<u>C2AE</u>	<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>	Weighted Score <u>C2AE</u>
1.00	4.00	3.00	2.00	0.100
2.00	4.00	3.00	2.00	0.400
1.00	3.00	3.00	1.00	0.100
2.00	4.00	3.00	2.00	0.400
1.00	4.00	3.00	2.00	0.050
1.00	4.00	3.00	2.00	0.050
1.00	4.00	3.00	2.00	0.050

1.15

1.00	3.00	2.00	2.00
2.00	4.00	3.00	1.00

0.20

0.10

0.30

1.45

<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>	<u>Notes/Questions</u>
0.400	0.300	0.200	
0.800	0.600	0.400	
0.300	0.300	0.100	
0.800	0.600	0.400	
0.200	0.150	0.100	
0.200	0.150	0.100	
0.200	0.150	0.100	
2.90	2.25	1.40	

0.60

0.40

0.40

0.20

0.15

0.05

0.80

0.55

0.45

3.70

2.80

1.85

BLUE STAR TRAIL-NORTH SECTION

EVALUATION OF ENGINEERING FIRM PROPOSALS TO SELECT TWO FINALISTS

Criteria Categories

Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs

		Weight
1	Firm Experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	10.0%
2	Project leader experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	20.0%
3	Landscape Arcitect experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	10.0%
4	Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants.	20.0%
5	Experience with multi-jurisdiction projects	5.0%
6	Traffic Engineer Experience	5.0%
7	Experience in workng with a Fire or Police Department in the design of a road or trail	5.0%
	Technical Weighting	75.0%

Management - features or qualities of bidder as an organization (e.g., management approach, capacity to deliver, interest, finanacial capacity, business size & type, proprietary rights, references of past performance)

Weight

8	Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/construction, inspection/quality control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC, communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc).	20.0%
9	Familiarity and experience in project work in proximity to S-D, including working with MDOT and Allegan County Road Commission	5.0%
	Management Weighting	25.0%
	TOTAL SCORE	100.0%

TCC SUMMARY - Firm Average of Raters by Criteria

1-Mar-21

Rank order 1-4 each Bidder against each criteria (1 is top rank).

If equal, use same score; e.g. all equal score 1, 1, 1, 1; three are equal, 1, 2, 1, 1, etc.

<u>C2AE</u>	<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>	Weighted Score
				<u>C2AE</u>
1.00	3.13	2.13	1.75	0.10
1.13	2.88	2.25	2.50	0.23
1.38	2.25	2.50	1.63	0.14
1.25	3.00	2.00	1.75	0.25
1.13	3.38	2.50	1.63	0.06
1.75	3.38	2.38	2.38	0.09
1.00	3.25	2.63	2.25	0.05

0.91

1.00	2.63	1.75	1.88
1.63	3.50	2.50	1.13

0.20

0.08

0.28

1.19

Rank Order

**1
C2AE**

<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>	<u>Notes/Questions</u>
0.31	0.21	0.18	
0.58	0.45	0.50	
0.23	0.25	0.16	
0.60	0.40	0.35	
0.17	0.13	0.08	
0.17	0.12	0.12	
0.16	0.13	0.11	
2.21	1.69	1.50	

0.53

0.35

0.38

0.18

0.13

0.06

0.70

0.48

0.43

2.91

2.16

1.93

4

3

2

Beckett Raeder Moore Bruggink **Wightman**

BLUE STAR TRAIL-NORTH SECTION

EVALUATION OF ENGINEERING FIRM PROPOSALS TO SELECT TWO FINALISTS

TCC SUMMARY - Firm Averages by Rater

1-Mar-21

<u>Rater</u>	<u>C2AE</u>	<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>
Kathy	1.15	1.75	1.1	1.55
Jerry	1.45	2.7	2	2
Brenda	1	3.25	2.2	2.1
Cindy	1	2.05	1.15	1
Holly	1.15	3.9	3.05	2.1
Ken	1.15	2.05	1.9	2.2
RichD	1.15	3.9	3.1	2.65
John	1.45	3.7	2.8	1.85
8	1.19	2.91	2.16	1.93

Rank Order

1
C2AE

4
Beckett Raeder

3
Moore Bruggink

2
Wightman