#### 2021 TRI-COMMUNITY NON-MOTORIZED TRAIL COMMITTEE AGENDA SPECIAL MEETING FRIDAY, MARCH 5, 2021 – 2:00 P.M.

#### 1. CALL TO ORDER

- 2. ROLL CALL
- 3. APPROVAL OF AGENDA
- 4. PUBLIC COMMENTS/TODAY'S AGENDA TOPICS ONLY (LIMIT 3 MINUTES) Use the "raise hand" button in the participant's screen found in the Zoom interface or enter \*9 if calling in by phone to raise hand.
- 5. REVIEW ENGINEERING PROPOSALS UTILIZING RANKING TOOL, COMPARISON SHEET & COMMITTEE DISCUSSION
- 6. VOTE FOR TWO ENGINEERING FIRMS TO INTERVIEW
- 7. REVIEW NEXT STEPS
- 8. PUBLIC COMMENTS (LIMIT 3 MINUTES) Use the "raise hand" button in the participant's screen found in the Zoom interface or enter \*9 if calling in by phone to raise hand.
- 9. MEMBER CLOSING COMMENTS

#### **NOTICE:**

This public meeting will be held using Zoom video/audio conference technology due to the COVID-19 restrictions currently in place.

Join online by visiting: https://us02web.zoom.us/j/2698 572603

> Join by phone by dialing: (312) 626-6799 -or-(646) 518-9805

Then enter "Meeting ID": 2698572603

Please send questions or comments regarding meeting agenda items prior to meeting to: <u>hleo@saugatuckcity.com</u>

							1				1	
	BLUE STAR TRAIL-NORTH SECTION									<u> </u>	+	
	BLUE STAR TRAIL-NORTH SECTION EVALUATION OF ENGINEERING FIRM PROPOSALS TO SELECT		L									
	LUGENTION OF ENGINEERING FIRM FROPOSALS TO SELECT	TWO FINALI	2/23/21							DRAFT	-	DRAFT
				p rank) each Bidder aga	inst each criteria					DRAFT		DRAFT
-				re; e.g. all equal score 1		al. 1. 2. 1. 1 etc.	Weighted Score			<del> </del>	+	
	Evaluation Criteria \ Bidder	Weight	<u>C2AE</u>	Beckett Raeder	Moore Bruggink	Wightman	C2AE	Beckett Raeder	Moore Bruggink	Wightman		Notes/Questions
R	Requirements	weight	<u>1401</u>	Deckett Hacael	MODIC DI GEEIIIN	Wightingh		Deekett Nacael	WOOLC DI GEEIIIN	Wightingh		Hotes/ ouestions
R1.1	Firm services provided and relevance to this project	2.5%	1	1	2	1	0.03	0.03	0.05	0.03		
R1.2	Description of proposed Project Team Roles & Responsibilities	2.5%		2	1	1	0.03	0.05	0.03	0.03		
R2.1	Experience of Project Manager	20.0%	1	1	2	3	0.20	0.20	0.40	0.60		
R2.2	Experience of Landscape Architect	5.0%		1	2	3	0.10	0.05	0.10	0.15		
R2.3	Experience of Traffic Engineer	15.0%	1	1	1	1	0.15	0.15	0.15	0.15		
	Experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or											
R3.1	other projects similar in scope	7.5%	1	1	2	1	0.08	0.08	0.15	0.08		
R3.2	Tools examples provided: project budget examples, cost estimate examples, results (contact references to validate)	2.5%	2	2	1	2	0.05	0.05	0.03	0.05		
	Firm prequalified with MDOT for pertinent scope of work	2.5%		1	1	1	0.03	0.03	0.03	0.03		
	Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/											
	construction, inspection/quality control, sub-contractor management,											
	grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC,											
R4	communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc).	10.0%		1 2	2	1	0.10	0.10	0.20	0.10		See 'Specific Tasks' of Section II
R5	Estimate of overall cost of service for project	10.0%	1	2	1	2	0.10	0.20	0.10	0.20		-
R6	Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants.	7.5%	1	1	2	2	0.08	0.08	0.15	0.15	1	1
10	Familiarity and experience in project work in proximity to S-D,	1.3%		-	-	-	0.00	0.00	0.10	0.15	1	Is part of this getting at current
R7	including working with MDOT and Allegan County Road Commission	2.5%	1	2	3	4	0.03	0.05	0.08	0.10		relationships/contacts?
	Experience in workng with a Fire or Police Department in the design										1	
R8	of a road or trail	2.5%		1	1	1	0.05	0.03	0.03	0.03	L	
R9	Experience with 'smart traffic signals' that are remotely controlled	2.5%		1	1	1	0.05	0.03	0.03	0.03		
R10	Evaluation of references provided for similar projects	5.0%	1	1	2	1	0.05	0.05	0.10	0.05	<del> </del>	
R11	Evaluation of Contract Form	2.5%	2	1	2	3	0.05	0.03	0.05	0.08	1	Is it comprehensive, is it clear, is it fair to both parties
NII	Evaluation of contract Form	2.3%	2	1	2	3	0.03	0.03	0.03	0.08		Tail to both parties
		100.0%	1.313	1.250	1.625	1.750	1.150	1.175	1.650	1.825		
							1					
												Use to help evaluate R1 - R11 as
												appropriate, use as tie-breaker, use
R12	Other Information Provided											to generate interview questions
	PED Evoluation Criteria Categoria	100 5-						1.57	4.55			
	RFP Evaluation Criteria Categories	100.0%					1.15	1.175	1.65	1.825		
	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider	100.0%		Declarit Decid								
	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs		<u>C2AE</u>	Beckett Raeder	Moore Bruggink	Wightman	<u>C2AE</u>	Beckett Raeder	Moore Bruggink	Wightman		
R1.2 R2 1	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs Description of proposed Project Team Roles & Responsibilities	2.5%	1	2	1	1	<u>C2AE</u> 0.025	Beckett Raeder 0.05	Moore Bruggink 0.025	<u>Wightman</u> 0.025		
R1.2 R2.1 R2.2	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs		1		Moore Bruggink 1 2 2		<u>C2AE</u>	Beckett Raeder	Moore Bruggink	Wightman		
R2.1	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's meeds Description of proposed Project Team Roles & Responsibilities Experience of Project Manager	2.5% 20.0%	1 1 2	2 1	1 2	1 3	<u>C2AE</u> 0.025 0.2	Beckett Raeder 0.05 0.2	Moore Bruggink 0.025 0.4	<u>Wightman</u> 0.025 0.6		
R2.1 R2.2	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs Description of proposed Project Team Roles & Responsibilities Experience of Project Manager Experience of Landscape Architect	2.5% 20.0% 5.0%	1 1 2	2 1 1	1 2 2	1 3 3	<u>C2AE</u> 0.025 0.2 0.1	Beckett Raeder 0.05 0.2 0.05	Moore Bruggink 0.025 0.4 0.1	Wightman 0.025 0.6 0.15		
R2.1 R2.2	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs Description of proposed Project Team Roles & Responsibilities Experience of Project Manager Experience of Landscape Architect	2.5% 20.0% 5.0%	1 1 2	2 1 1	1 2 2	1 3 3	<u>C2AE</u> 0.025 0.2 0.1	Beckett Raeder 0.05 0.2 0.05	Moore Bruggink 0.025 0.4 0.1	Wightman 0.025 0.6 0.15		
R2.1 R2.2	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs Description of project Team Roles & Responsibilities Experience of Landscape Architect Experience of Traffic Engineer Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/ construction, inspection/quality control, sub-contractor management,	2.5% 20.0% 5.0%	1 1 2	2 1 1	1 2 2	1 3 3	<u>C2AE</u> 0.025 0.2 0.1	Beckett Raeder 0.05 0.2 0.05	Moore Bruggink 0.025 0.4 0.1	Wightman 0.025 0.6 0.15		
R2.1 R2.2 R2.3	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs Description of proposed Project Team Roles & Responsibilities Experience of Landscape Architect Experience of Landscape Architect Experience of traffic Engineer Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/ construction, inspection/quality control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC,	2.5% 20.0% 5.0%	1 1 2 1	2 1 1	1 2 2 1	1 3 3	C2AE 0.025 0.2 0.1 0.15	Beckett Raeder 0.05 0.2 0.05 0.15	Moore Bruggink 0.025 0.4 0.1 0.15	<u>Wightman</u> 0.025 0.6 0.15 0.15		
R2.1 R2.2	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs Description of propsced Project Team Roles & Responsibilities Experience of Project Manager Experience of Traffic Engineer Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/ construction, inspection/quality control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC, communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc).	2.5% 20.0% 5.0%	1 1 2 1	2 1 1	1 2 2	1 3 3	<u>C2AE</u> 0.025 0.2 0.1	Beckett Raeder 0.05 0.2 0.05	Moore Bruggink 0.025 0.4 0.1	Wightman 0.025 0.6 0.15		
R2.1 R2.2 R2.3	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs Description of project Team Roles & Responsibilities Experience of Landscape Architect Experience of Traffic Engineer Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/ construction, inspection/quality control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC, communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc). Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in	2.5% 20.0% 5.0% 15.0%	1 2 1 1	2 1 1	1 2 2 1	1 3 3	<u>C2AE</u> 0.025 0.2 0.1 0.15	Beckett Raeder 0.05 0.2 0.05 0.15 0.1	Moore Bruggink 0.025 0.4 0.1 0.15 0.2	<u>Wightman</u> 0.025 0.6 0.15 0.15 0.15		
R2.1 R2.2 R2.3 R4 R6	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs Description of proposed Project Team Roles & Responsibilities Experience of Landscape Architect Experience of Landscape Architect Experience of Landscape Architect Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/ construction, inspection/quality control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC, communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc). Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants.	2.5% 20.0% 5.0% 15.0% 10.0% 7.5%	1 2 1 1 1	2 1 1 1 1 1 1	1 2 2 1 2 2 2 2 2	1 3 3 1	C2AE 0.025 0.2 0.1 0.15 0.1 0.1	Beckett Raeder 0.05 0.2 0.05 0.15 0.15 0.1	Moore Bruggink 0.025 0.4 0.1 0.15 0.2 0.2	Wightman     0.025   0.6     0.15   0.15     0.15   0.15		
R2.1 R2.2 R2.3 R4	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs Description of project Team Roles & Responsibilities Experience of Landscape Architect Experience of Traffic Engineer Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/ construction, inspection/quality control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC, communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc). Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in	2.5% 20.0% 5.0% 15.0%	1 2 1 1 1 1 2	2 1 1 1 1	1 2 2 1 2 2	1 3 3 1 1 2	C2AE 0.025 0.2 0.1 0.15 0.15 0.15 0.75 0.05	Beckett Raeder 0.05 0.2 0.05 0.15 0.1 0.075 0.025 0.65	Moore Bruggink 0.025 0.4 0.1 0.15 0.2	<u>Wightman</u> 0.025 0.6 0.15 0.15 0.15		
R2.1 R2.2 R2.3 R4 R6	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs Description of propsed Project Team Roles & Responsibilities Experience of Landscape Architect Experience of Traffic Engineer Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/ construction, inspection/quality control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC, communication plan (key stateholders), change management, etc). Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants. Experience with "smart traffic signals" that are remotely controlled	2.5% 20.0% 5.0% 15.0% 10.0% 7.5% 2.5%	1 2 1 1 1 1 2	2 1 1 1 1 1 1	1 2 2 1 2 2 2 2 2	1 3 3 1 1 2	<u>C2AE</u> 0.025 0.2 0.1 0.15 0.1 0.075 0.05	Beckett Raeder 0.05 0.2 0.05 0.15 0.1 0.075 0.025 0.65	Moore Bruggink 0.025 0.4 0.1 0.15 0.2 0.2 0.2 0.15 0.025	Wightman     0.025     0.6     0.15     0.15     0.1     0.15		
R2.1 R2.2 R2.3 R4 R6	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs Description of propsed Project Team Roles & Responsibilities Experience of Landscape Architect Experience of Traffic Engineer Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/ construction, inspection/quality control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC, communication plan (key stateholders), change management, etc). Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants. Experience with "smart traffic signals" that are remotely controlled	2.5% 20.0% 5.0% 15.0% 10.0% 7.5% 2.5%	1 2 1 1 1 1 2	2 1 1 1 1 1 1	1 2 2 1 2 2 2 2 2	1 3 3 1 1 2	C2AE 0.025 0.2 0.1 0.15 0.15 0.15 0.75 0.05	Beckett Raeder 0.05 0.2 0.05 0.15 0.1 0.075 0.025 0.65	Moore Bruggink 0.025 0.4 0.1 0.15 0.2 0.2 0.2 0.15 0.025	Wightman     0.025     0.6     0.15     0.15     0.1     0.15		
R2.1 R2.2 R2.3 R4 R6	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs Description of proposed Project Team Roles & Responsibilities Experience of Landscape Architect Experience of Landscape Architect Experience of Landscape Architect Experience of Landscape Architect and write/management, project reporting with TCC, communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc). Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants. Experience with 'smart traffic signals' that are remotely controlled Technical Weighting	2.5% 20.0% 5.0% 15.0% 10.0% 7.5% 2.5%	1 2 1 1 1 1 2	2 1 1 1 1 1 1	1 2 2 1 2 2 2 2 2	1 3 3 1 1 2	C2AE 0.025 0.2 0.1 0.15 0.15 0.15 0.75 0.05	Beckett Raeder 0.05 0.2 0.05 0.15 0.1 0.075 0.025 0.65	Moore Bruggink 0.025 0.4 0.1 0.15 0.2 0.2 0.2 0.15 0.025	Wightman     0.025     0.6     0.15     0.15     0.1     0.15		
R2.1 R2.2 R2.3 R4 R6 R9	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs Description of propsced Project Team Roles & Responsibilities Experience of Project Manager Experience of Traffic Engineer Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/ construction, inspection/quality control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC, communication plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc). Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants. Experience with 'smart traffic signals' that are remotely controlled <b>Technical Weighting</b> <b>Price - project cost, life-cycle cost</b>	2.5% 20.0% 5.0% 15.0% 10.0% 7.5% 62.5%	1 2 1 1 1 1 2 1 2 1 2 1 2		2 2 1 2 2 1 2 1 1	1 3 3 1 1 2 1	C2AE 0.025 0.2 0.1 0.15 0.15 0.15 0.05 0.75 0.05 0.7 Technical Rank	Beckett Raeder 0.05 0.2 0.05 0.15 0.1 0.1 0.075 0.025 0.65	Moore Bruggink 0.025 0.4 0.1 0.15 0.2 0.2 0.15 0.025 1.05	Wightman     0.025     0.6     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15		
R2.1 R2.2 R2.3 R4 R6 R9	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs Description of proposed Project Team Roles & Responsibilities Experience of Landscape Architect Experience of Landscape Architect Experience of Landscape Architect Experience of Inafice Engineer Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/ construction, inspection/quality control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC, communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc). Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants. Experience with 'smart traffic signals' that are remotely controlled Technical Weighting	2.5% 20.0% 5.0% 15.0% 10.0% 7.5% 2.5%	1 2 1 1 1 1 2	2 1 1 1 1 1 1	1 2 2 1 2 2 2 2 2	1 3 3 1 1 2	C2AE 0.025 0.2 0.1 0.15 0.15 0.15 0.075 0.075 0.07 0.05 0.7 Technical Rank	Beckett Raeder 0.05 0.2 0.05 0.15 0.1 0.075 0.025 0.65	Moore Bruggink 0.025 0.4 0.1 0.15 0.2 0.2 0.2 0.15 0.025	Wightman     0.025     0.6     0.15     0.15     0.1     0.15		
R2.1 R2.2 R2.3 R4 R6 R9	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs Description of propsced Project Team Roles & Responsibilities Experience of Project Manager Experience of Traffic Engineer Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/ construction, inspection/quality control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC, communication plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc). Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants. Experience with 'smart traffic signals' that are remotely controlled <b>Technical Weighting</b> <b>Price - project cost, life-cycle cost</b>	2.5% 20.0% 5.0% 15.0% 10.0% 7.5% 62.5%	1 2 1 1 1 1 2 1 2 1 2 1 2		2 2 1 2 2 1 2 1 1	1 3 3 1 1 2 1	C2AE 0.025 0.2 0.1 0.15 0.15 0.15 0.05 0.75 0.05 0.7 Technical Rank	Beckett Raeder 0.05 0.2 0.05 0.15 0.1 0.1 0.075 0.025 0.65	Moore Bruggink 0.025 0.4 0.1 0.15 0.2 0.2 0.15 0.025 1.05	Wightman     0.025     0.6     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15		
R2.1 R2.2 R2.3 R4 R6 R9	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs Description of proposed Project Team Roles & Responsibilities Experience of Landscape Architect Experience of Landscape Architect Experience (Landscape Architect) Experience (Landscape Architect) Estimate of overall cost of service for project	2.5% 20.0% 5.0% 15.0% 10.0% 7.5% 62.5%	1 2 1 1 1 1 2 1 2 1 2 1 2		2 2 1 2 2 1 2 1 1	1 3 3 1 1 2 1	C2AE 0.025 0.2 0.1 0.15 0.15 0.15 0.075 0.075 0.07 0.05 0.7 Technical Rank	Beckett Raeder 0.05 0.2 0.05 0.15 0.1 0.1 0.075 0.025 0.65	Moore Bruggink 0.025 0.4 0.1 0.15 0.2 0.2 0.15 0.025 1.05	Wightman     0.025     0.6     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15		
R2.1 R2.2 R2.3 R4 R6 R9	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs Description of propsced Project Team Roles & Responsibilities Experience of Project Manager Experience of Traffic Engineer Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/ construction, inspection/quality control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC, communication plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc). Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants. Experience with 'smart traffic signals' that are remotely controlled <b>Technical Weighting</b> <b>Price - project cost, life-cycle cost</b>	2.5% 20.0% 5.0% 15.0% 10.0% 7.5% 62.5%	1 2 1 1 1 1 2 1 2 1 2 1 2		2 2 1 2 2 1 2 1 1	1 3 3 1 1 2 1	C2AE 0.025 0.2 0.1 0.15 0.15 0.15 0.075 0.075 0.07 0.05 0.7 Technical Rank	Beckett Raeder 0.05 0.2 0.05 0.15 0.1 0.1 0.075 0.025 0.65	Moore Bruggink 0.025 0.4 0.1 0.15 0.2 0.2 0.15 0.025 1.05	Wightman     0.025     0.6     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15		
R2.1 R2.2 R2.3 R4 R6 R9	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's need Description of proposed Project Team Roles & Responsibilities Experience of Iradica Project Manager Experience of Landscape Architect Experience of Landscape Architect Experience of Iradica Engineer Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/ construction, inspection/quality control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC, communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc). Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants. Experience with 'smart traffic signals' that are remotely controlled Technical Weighting Price - project cost, life-cycle cost Estimate of overall cost of service for project Management - features or qualities of bidder as an organization (e.g., management approach, capacity to deliver, interest, finanacial capacit), busines size & type, projectiary rights, references of past	2.5% 20.0% 5.0% 15.0% 10.0% 7.5% 62.5%	1 2 1 1 1 1 2 1 2 1 2 1 2		2 2 1 2 2 1 2 1 1	1 3 3 1 1 2 1	C2AE 0.025 0.2 0.1 0.15 0.15 0.15 0.075 0.075 0.07 0.05 0.7 Technical Rank	Beckett Raeder 0.05 0.2 0.05 0.15 0.1 0.1 0.075 0.025 0.65	Moore Bruggink 0.025 0.4 0.1 0.15 0.2 0.2 0.15 0.025 1.05	Wightman     0.025     0.6     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15		
R2.1 R2.2 R2.3 R4 R6 R9 R5	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's need Description of proposed Project Team Roles & Responsibilities Experience of Project Manager Experience of Traffic Engineer Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/ construction, inspection/quality control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC, communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc). Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants. Experience with Srant traffic signals' that are remotely controlled Technical Weighting Price – project cost, life-cycle cost Estimate of overall cost of service for project Management - features or qualities of bidder as an organization (e.g., management approach, capacity to deliver, interest, finanacial capacity, business size & type, proprietary rights, references of past performance)	2.5% 20.0% 5.0% 15.0% 7.5% 62.5%			2 2 1 2 2 1 2 1 1	1 3 3 1 1 2 1	C2AE 0.025 0.2 0.1 0.15 0.15 0.15 0.7 Technical Rank	Beckett Raeder 0.05 0.2 0.05 0.15 0.1 0.075 0.025 0.65 0.2 0.2	Moore Bruggink 0.025 0.4 0.1 0.15 0.2 0.15 0.25 1.05 0.25	Wightman     0.025     0.6     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.25     0.2		
R2.1 R2.2 R2.3 R4 R6 R9 R5	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs Description of proposed Project Team Roles & Responsibilities Experience of Landscape Architect Experience of Landscape Architect Experience of tradfic Engineer Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/ construction, inspection/quality control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC, communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc). Experience with 'smart traffic signals' that are remotely controlled Technical Weighting Price - project cost, life-cycle cost Estimate of overall cost of service for project Management - features or qualities of bidder as an organization (e.g., management approach, capacity to deliver, interest, finanacial capacity, business size & type, proprietary rights, references of past performance) Firm services provided and relevance to this project	2.5% 20.0% 5.0% 15.0% 10.0% 7.5% 62.5%			2 2 1 2 2 1 2 1 1	1 3 3 1 1 2 1	C2AE 0.025 0.2 0.1 0.15 0.15 0.15 0.075 0.075 0.07 0.05 0.7 Technical Rank	Beckett Raeder 0.05 0.2 0.05 0.15 0.1 0.1 0.075 0.025 0.65	Moore Bruggink 0.025 0.4 0.1 0.15 0.2 0.2 0.15 0.025 1.05	Wightman     0.025     0.6     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15		
R2.1 R2.2 R2.3 R4 R6 R9 R5 R5 R5	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's need     Description of proposed Project Team Roles & Responsibilities     Experience of Project Manager     Experience of Indiscape Architect     Experience with Grant Writing and working with TCC.     Communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc).     Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants.     Experience with 'smart traffic signals' that are remotely controlled     Stimate of overall cost of service for project     Management - features or qualities of bidder as an organization (e.g., management approach, capacity to deliver, interest, financial capacity, business size & type, proprietary rights, references of past performance)     Firm services provided and relevance to this project	2.5% 20.0% 5.0% 15.0% 10.0% 62.5%				1 3 3 1 2 1 2 1 2 2 2	C2AE 0.025 0.2 0.1 0.15 0.1 0.15 0.7 Technical Rank Price Rank	Beckett Raeder 0.05 0.2 0.05 0.15 0.1 0.1 0.075 0.025 0.65 0.2 0.2 0.025	Moore Bruggink 0.025 0.4 0.1 0.15 0.2 0.15 0.25 1.05 0.1 0.1 0.1	Wightman 0.025 0.6 0.15 0.15 0.15 0.15 0.15 0.2 0.2 0.2 0.025		
R2.1 R2.2 R2.3 R4 R6 R9 R5	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs Description of proposed Project Team Roles & Responsibilities Experience of Iradiscape Architect Experience of Landscape Architect Experience of Iradiscape Architect Experience of Iradiscape Architect Experience of Iradiscape Architect Experience with anagernet, project reporting with TCC, communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc). Experience with Srant Writing and working with MOCT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants. Experience with Srant Writing signals' that are remotely controlled <b>Technical Weighting</b> <b>Price - project cost, life-cycle cost</b> Estimate of overall cost of service for project Management - features or qualities of bidder as an organization (e.g., management, project, capacity to deliver, interest, financial capacity, business size & type, proprietary rights, references of past performance) Firm services provided and relevance to this project Experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other project similar in scope	2.5% 20.0% 5.0% 15.0% 7.5% 62.5%			2 2 1 2 2 1 2 1 1	1 3 3 1 1 2 1	C2AE 0.025 0.2 0.1 0.15 0.15 0.15 0.7 Technical Rank	Beckett Raeder 0.05 0.2 0.05 0.15 0.1 0.075 0.025 0.65 0.2 0.2	Moore Bruggink 0.025 0.4 0.1 0.15 0.2 0.15 0.25 1.05 0.25	Wightman     0.025     0.6     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.25     0.2		
R2.1 R2.2 R2.3 R4 R6 R9 R5 R5 R5	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's need Description of proposed Project Team Roles & Responsibilities Experience of Iradica Project Manager Experience of Landscape Architect Experience with Section 2000 and 2	2.5% 20.0% 5.0% 15.0% 10.0% 2.5% 2.5% 10.0%				1 3 3 1 2 1 2 1 2 2 2	C2AE 0.025 0.2 0.1 0.15 0.15 0.15 0.1 0.075 0.07 Technical Rank 0.1 Price Rank	Beckett Raeder 0.05 0.2 0.05 0.15 0.1 0.1 0.075 0.025 0.65 0.2 0.25 0.025 0.025 0.075	Moore Bruggink 0.025 0.4 0.15 0.2 0.15 0.25 1.05 0.25 1.05 0.15 0.15 0.15	Wightman     0.025     0.6     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.16     0.17     0.2     0.2     0.25     0.025     0.075		
R2.1 R2.2 R2.3 R4 R6 R9 R5 R5 R5 R5 R5	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs Description of proposed Project Team Roles & Responsibilities Experience of Iradiscape Architect Experience of Landscape Architect Experience of Iradiscape Architect Experience of Iradiscape Architect Experience of Iradiscape Architect Experience with anagernet, project reporting with TCC, communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc). Experience with Srant Writing and working with MODT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants. Experience with Srant Writing signals' that are remotely controlled <b>Technical Weighting</b> <b>Price - project cost, life-cycle cost</b> Estimate of overall cost of service for project Management - features or qualities of bidder as an organization (e.g., management, project, capacity to deliver, interest, financial capacity, business size & type, proprietary rights, references of past performance) Firm services provided and relevance to this project Experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other project similar in scope	2.5% 20.0% 5.0% 15.0% 10.0% 62.5%				1 3 3 1 2 1 2 1 2 2 2	C2AE 0.025 0.2 0.1 0.15 0.1 0.15 0.7 Technical Rank Price Rank	Beckett Raeder 0.05 0.2 0.05 0.15 0.1 0.1 0.075 0.025 0.65 0.2 0.2 0.025	Moore Bruggink 0.025 0.4 0.1 0.15 0.2 0.15 0.25 1.05 0.1 0.1 0.1	Wightman 0.025 0.6 0.15 0.15 0.15 0.15 0.15 0.2 0.2 0.2 0.025		
R2.1 R2.2 R2.3 R4 R6 R9 R5 R5 R5 R5 R3.1 R3.1 R3.2 R3.3	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's need:     Description of proposed Project Team Roles & Responsibilities     Experience of Project Manager     Experience of Traffic Engineer     Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/ construction, inspection/quality control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC, communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc).     Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants.     Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants.     Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants.     Experience with Smart traffic signals' that are remotely controlled Technical Weighting     Price - project cost, life-cycle cost     Estimate of overall cost of service for project     Management - features or qualities of bidder as an organization (e.g., management approach, capacity to deliver, interest, finanacial capacity, business size & type, proprietary rights, references of past performance)     Firm services provided and relevance to this project     Experience in designing, building, and managing bite trails and/or other project similar in scope     Tools examples, provided, project budget examples, cost estimate examples, results (contact references to validate)     Firm sregualified with MDOT for pertinent scope of work Familiarity and	2.5% 20.0% 5.0% 15.0% 7.5% 62.5% 10.0%	1 1 2 1 1 1 2 1 1 2 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	2 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 2 1 1 1 2 1 1 1 2 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1		1 3 3 1 2 1 2 1 2 2 1 1 1 2 1 2 2 1 2 2 1 2 2 2 1 2 2 2 1 2 2 2 2 1 2 2 2 2 1 2	C2AE 0.025 0.2 0.1 0.15 0.15 0.075 0.07 0.7 Technical Rank Price Rank 0.1 Price Rank	Beckett Raeder 0.05 0.2 0.05 0.1 0.1 0.075 0.025 0.65 0.2 0.2 0.025 0.025 0.05 0.075 0.05 0.05 0.05 0.05	Moore Bruggink 0.025 0.4 0.1 0.15 0.2 0.15 0.025 1.05 0.15 0.05 0.15 0.05 0.15 0.05 0.25 0.025 0.025	Wightman     0.025     0.6     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.2025     0.2     0.2     0.25     0.075     0.05     0.025		
R2.1 R2.2 R2.3 R4 R6 R9 R5 R5 R5 R5 R5 R3.1 R3.1 R3.2	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs Description of proposed Project Team Roles & Responsibilities Experience of Project Manager Experience I candscape Architect Experience I candscape Architect Experience I candscape Architect Experience I candscape Architect Experience Virandfue (e.g. table), abu-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC, communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc). Experience with Srant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants. Experience with 'smart traffic signals' that are remotely controlled Technical Weighting Price - project cost, life-cycle cost Estimate of overall cost of service for project Management - features or qualities of bidder as an organization (e.g., management approach, capacity to deliver, interest, financial capacity, business size & type, proprietary rights, references of past performance) Firm services provided and relevance to this project Experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects Siz (contact references to validate) Firm prequalified with MDOT for pertinent scope of work Familiarity and experience in project to project work in proximity to 5-0, including working with MDOT and Allegan Courk Read Commission	2.5% 20.0% 5.0% 15.0% 7.5% 62.5% 10.0%	1 1 2 1 1 1 2 1 1 2 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	2 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 2 1 1 1 2 1 1 2 1 1 2 2 1 1 2 2 1 1 2 2 1 1 2 2 1 1 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2		1 3 3 1 2 1 2 1 2 2 1 1 1 2 1 2 2 1 2 2 1 2 2 2 1 2 2 2 1 2 2 2 2 1 2 2 2 2 1 2	C2AE 0.025 0.2 0.1 0.1 0.15 0.1 0.075 0.05 0.7 Technical Rank 0.1 Price Rank 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025	Beckett Raeder 0.05 0.2 0.05 0.1 0.1 0.075 0.025 0.65 0.2 0.2 0.025 0.05 0.05 0.05	Moore Bruggink 0.025 0.4 0.1 0.1 0.1 0.2 0.15 0.025 <b>1.05</b> 0.1 0.1 0.1 0.05 0.15 0.05	Wightman     0.025     0.6     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.25     0.2     0.2     0.2     0.2     0.025     0.025     0.025     0.025		
R2.1 R2.2 R2.3 R4 R6 R9 R5 R5 R5 R5 R3.1 R3.1 R3.2 R3.3 R7	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's need:   Description of proposed Project Team Roles & Responsibilities   Experience of Project Manager   Experience of Landscape Architect   Experience of Landscape Architect   Experience of Landscape Architect   Experience of Traffic Engineer   Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/ construction, inspection/quality control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC, communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc).   Experience with Grant Writing and working with MOOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants.   Experience with Grant Writing and working with MOOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants.   Experience with 'smart traffic signals' that are remotely controlled Technical Weighting   Estimate of overall cost of service for project   Management - features or qualities of bidder as an organization (e.g., management approach, capacity to deliver, interest, finanacial capacity, busines size & type, proprietary rights, references of past performance)   Firm services provided and relevance to this project   Experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope   Imm prequalified with MOOT for projent towing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope   Firm services provided and relevance to twolking proximity to S-D, including working, with MDOT and Algan Co	2.5% 20.0% 5.0% 15.0% 7.5% 2.5% 2.5% 2.5% 2.5% 2.5%	1 2 1 1 1 1 1 2 1 1 1 1 1 2 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	2 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 2 1 1 1 2 1 1 1 2 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1		1 3 3 1 2 1 2 1 2 2 2 1 1 2 1 2 1 2 1 1 2 1 1 2 1 1 2 1 1 2 1	C2AE 0.025 0.2 0.1 0.15 0.15 0.15 0.15 0.7 Technical Rank Price Rank 0.1 Price Rank 0.025 0.075 0.025 0.025	Beckett Raeder 0.05 0.2 0.05 0.15 0.1 0.1 0.075 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.05	Moore Bruggink 0.025 0.4 0.15 0.2 0.15 0.25 1.05 0.025 0.025 0.05 0.15 0.05 0.15 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025	Wightman     0.025     0.6     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.25     0.2     0.2     0.2     0.2     0.2     0.2     0.2     0.2     0.2     0.2     0.2     0.2     0.2     0.2     0.25     0.025     0.025     0.025     0.025     0.025     0.025     0.025     0.05     0.05     0.1		
R2.1 R2.2 R2.3 R4 R6 R9 R5 R5 R5 R3.1 R3.1 R3.1 R3.2 R3.3 R7 R8	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs Description of proposed Project Team Roles & Responsibilities Experience of Iradiscape Architect Experience of Landscape Architect Experience of tradicape Architect Experience of tradicape Architect Experience of tradicape Architect Experience of tradicape Architect Experience of the Grant Writing and working with TCC, communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc). Experience with Srant Writing and working with MODT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants. Experience with Srant Writing and working with MODT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants. Experience with 'smart traffic signals' that are remotely controlled <b>Technical Weighting</b> <b>Price project cost, life-cycle cost</b> Estimate of overall cost of service for project Management - features or qualities of bidder as an organization (e.g., management provided and relevance to this project Experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects locatic, iropiect budget examples, cost estimate examples, results (contact references to validate) Firm perugabilities (contact references to validate) Firm prequalified with MDDT for pertinent scope of work Familiarity and experience in project todget examples, cost estimate examples, results (contact references to validate) Firm prequalified with MDDT for pertinent scope of work Familiarity and experience in project work in proximity to 5-0, including working with BDT and Allegaan Courty Read Commission Experience in working with a Fire or Police Department in the design of a road or trail	2.5% 20.0% 5.0% 15.0% 7.5% 2.5% 62.5% 10.0%	1 1 2 1 1 1 2 1 1 2 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 2 1 1 1 1 1 2 1 1 1 1 1 2 1 1 1 2 1 1 1 2 1 1 1 2 1 1 1 2 1 1 1 2 1 1 1 2 1 1 1 2 1 1 1 2 1 1 1 2 1 1 1 2 1 1 1 2 1 1 1 1 2 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	2 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 2 1 1 2 1 1 2 1 1 2 1 1 2 1 1 1 2 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1			C2AE 0.025 0.2 0.1 0.15 0.15 0.15 0.075 0.05 0.75 0.05 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.05	Beckett Raeder 0.05 0.2 0.05 0.15 0.15 0.075 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.05 0.025 0.05 0.05 0.025	Moore Bruggink 0.025 0.4 0.1 0.15 0.25 0.025 0.05 0.15 0.05 0.05 0.15 0.025 0.05 0.15 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025	Wightman     0.025     0.6     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.025     0.025     0.025     0.075     0.05     0.025     0.11		
R2.1 R2.2 R2.3 R4 R5 R5 R5 R5 R5 R5 R5 R5 R5 R5 R5 R5 R5	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's need:   Description of proposed Project Team Roles & Responsibilities   Experience of Project Manager   Experience of Landscape Architect   Experience of Landscape Architect   Experience of Landscape Architect   Experience of Traffic Engineer   Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/ construction, inspection/quality control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC, communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc).   Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants.   Experience with 'smart traffic signals' that are remotely controlled Technical Weighting   Price - project cost, life-cycle cost   Estimate of overall cost of service for project   Emmanacel   Firm services provided and relevance to this project   Experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope   Tools examples provided: project builder examples, cost estimate examples, results (contact references to validate)   Firm requalified with MDOT for periotents rights of work Familiarly and experience in project with project Mork Familiarly and experience in project work in proximity to S-0, including working with MDT and Allegan County Road Commission Experience in working with MDT and Allegan County Road Commission	2.5% 20.0% 5.0% 15.0% 15.0% 7.5% 2.5% 2.5% 2.5% 2.5% 2.5% 2.5%	1 2 1 1 2 1 1 2 1 1 2 1 1 1 1 2 1 1 1 2 1 1 1 2 1 1 1 2 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	2 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 2 1 1 2 1 1 2 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	1 2 2 1 1 2 2 1 1 1 1 2 2 2 1 1 1 1 3 1 2	1 3 3 1 1 2 1 2 1 - - - - - - - - - - - - -	C2AE 0.025 0.2 0.1 0.15 0.15 0.075 0.075 0.07 0.075 0.07 0.075 0.07 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.05 0.05	Beckett Raeder, 0.05 0.2 0.05 0.15 0.1 0.1 0.075 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.05 0.05	Moore Bruggink 0.025 0.4 0.1 0.15 0.2 0.15 0.025 1.05 0.025 0.05 0.15 0.025 0.015	Wightman     0.025     0.6     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.025     0.025     0.025     0.025     0.025     0.025     0.11     0.025     0.12		
R2.1 R2.2 R2.3 R4 R6 R9 R5 R5 R5 R3.1 R3.1 R3.1 R3.2 R3.3 R7 R8	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's need:     Description of proposed Project Team Roles & Responsibilities     Experience of Project Manager     Experience of Traffic Engineer     Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/ construction, inspection/quality control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC, communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc).     Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants.     Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants.     Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants.     Experience with Smart traffic signals' that are remotely controlled Technical Weighting     Price - project cost, life-cycle cost     Estimate of overall cost of service for project     Management - features or qualities of bidder as an organization (e.g., management approach, capacity to deliver, interest, finanacial capacity, business size & type, proprietary rights, references of past performance)     Firm services provided and relevance to this project     Experience in designing, building, and managing bite trails and/or other project similar in scope     Tools examples, results (contact references to validate)     Firm services provided in troject twolk in project work Familiarity and experience in project work in project work is project work	2.5% 20.0% 5.0% 15.0% 7.5% 62.5% 10.0% 10.0% 2.5% 2.5% 2.5% 2.5% 2.5% 5.0% 2.5%	1 1 2 1 1 1 1 2 1 1 2 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	2 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 2 1 1 2 1 1 2 1 1 2 1 1 2 1 1 1 2 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1			C2AE 0.025 0.2 0.1 0.15 0.1 0.15 0.075 0.075 0.07 0.7 Technical Rank Price Rank 0.1 0.1 0.2 0.025 0.075 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025	Beckett Raeder 0.05 0.2 0.05 0.15 0.15 0.075 0.025 0.025 0.05 0.025 0.05 0.025 0.05 0.05 0.025 0.025 0.05 0.	Moore Bruggink 0.025 0.4 0.1 0.15 0.2 0.15 0.025 1.05 0.025 0.05 0.05 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.05 0	Wightman     0.025     0.6     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.205     0.025     0.025     0.025     0.05     0.025     0.05     0.05     0.05     0.05     0.05		
R2.1 R2.2 R2.3 R4 R5 R5 R5 R5 R5 R5 R5 R5 R5 R5 R5 R5 R5	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's need:   Description of proposed Project Team Roles & Responsibilities   Experience of Project Manager   Experience of Landscape Architect   Experience of Landscape Architect   Experience of Landscape Architect   Experience of Traffic Engineer   Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/ construction, inspection/quality control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC, communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc).   Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants.   Experience with 'smart traffic signals' that are remotely controlled Technical Weighting   Price - project cost, life-cycle cost   Estimate of overall cost of service for project   Emmanacel   Firm services provided and relevance to this project   Experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope   Tools examples provided: project builder examples, cost estimate examples, results (contact references to validate)   Firm requalified with MDOT for periotents rights of work Familiarly and experience in project with project Mork Familiarly and experience in project work in proximity to S-0, including working with MDT and Allegan County Road Commission Experience in working with MDT and Allegan County Road Commission	2.5% 20.0% 5.0% 15.0% 7.5% 62.5% 10.0% 10.0% 2.5% 2.5% 2.5% 2.5% 2.5% 5.0% 2.5%	1 1 2 1 1 1 1 2 1 1 2 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	2 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 2 1 1 2 1 1 2 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	1 2 2 1 1 2 2 1 1 1 1 2 2 2 1 1 1 1 3 1 2	1 3 3 1 1 2 1 2 1 - - - - - - - - - - - - -	C2AE 0.025 0.2 0.1 0.15 0.15 0.075 0.075 0.07 0.075 0.07 0.075 0.07 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.025 0.05 0.05	Beckett Raeder, 0.05 0.2 0.05 0.15 0.1 0.1 0.075 0.025 0.05 0.025 0.05 0.025 0.05 0.025 0.05	Moore Bruggink 0.025 0.4 0.1 0.15 0.2 0.15 0.025 1.05 0.025 0.05 0.15 0.025 0.015	Wightman     0.025     0.6     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.15     0.025     0.025     0.025     0.025     0.025     0.025     0.11     0.025     0.12		

Kathy Mooradian

## **BLUE STAR TRAIL-NORTH SECTION EVALUATION OF ENGINEERING FIRM PROPOSALS TO SELECT TWO FINALISTS**

#### **<u>Criteria Categories</u>**

	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs	
		Weight
1 2	Firm Experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years) Project leader experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	10.0%
3	Landscape Arcitect experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	10.0%
4 5 6	Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants. Experience with multi-jurisdiction projects Traffic Engineer Experience	20.0% 5.0% 5.0%
7	Experience in workng with a Fire or Police Department in the design of a road or trail	5.0%
	Technical Weighting	75.0%
	Management - features or qualities of bidder as an organization (e.g., management approach, capacity to deliver, interest, finanacial capacity, business size & type, proprietary rights, references of past performance)	Weight

	Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/construction, inspection/quality	
	control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC,	
8	communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc).	20.0%
	Familiarity and experience in project work in proximity to S-D, including working with MDOT and	
9	Allegan County Road Commission	5.0%

Management Weighting	25.0%
----------------------	-------

TOTAL SCORE	100.0%
-------------	--------

# Rank order 1-4 each Bidder against each criteria (1 is top rank).

If equal, use same score; e.g. all equal score 1, 1, 1, 1; three are equal, 1, 2, 1, 1, etc.				
<u>C2AE</u>	<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>	<u>C2AE</u>
1.00	2.00	1.00	2.00	0.100
1.00	2.00	1.00	3.00	0.200
1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	0.100
1.00	2.00	1.00	1.00	0.200
1.00	2.00	1.00	1.00	0.050
3.00	2.00	2.00	1.00	0.150
1.00	2.00	2.00	2.00	0.050

1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	0.20
2.00	3.00	1.00	1.00	0.10

<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>
0.200	0.100	0.200
0.400	0.200	0.600
0.100	0.100	0.100
0.400	0.200	0.200
0.100	0.050	0.050
0.100	0.100	0.050
0.100	0.100	0.100
1.40	0.85	1.30

0.20	0.20	0.20
0.15	0.05	0.05
0.35	0.25	0.25
1.75	1.10	1.55

Jerry Donovan

8

## BLUE STAR TRAIL-NORTH SECTION EVALUATION OF ENGINEERING FIRM PROPOSALS TO SELECT TWO FINALISTS

#### **Criteria Categories**

	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs	
		Weight
1	Firm Experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	10.0%
2	Project leader experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	20.0%
3	Landscape Arcitect experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	10.0%
4	Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants.	20.0%
5	Experience with multi-jurisdiction projects	5.0%
6	Traffic Engineer Experience	5.0%
7	Experience in workng with a Fire or Police Department in the design of a road or trail	5.0%

Technical Weighting 75.0%

<b>Management</b> - features or qualities of bidder as an organization (e.g., management approach, capacity to deliver, interest, finanacial capacity, business size & type, proprietary rights, references of past performance)	Weight
Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/construction, inspection/quality	
control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC,	
communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc).	20.0%

	Familiarity and experience in project work in proximity to S-D, including working with MDOT and		
9	Allegan County Road Commission		
	Management Weighting	25.0%	
	TOTAL SCORE	100.0%	

# Rank order 1-4 each Bidder against each criteria (1 is top rank).

If equal, use same score; e.g. all equal score 1, 1, 1, 1; three are equal, 1, 2, 1, 1, etc.			Weighted Score	
<u>C2AE</u>	<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>	<u>C2AE</u>
1.00	3.00	2.00	2.00	0.100
1.00	3.00	2.00	2.00	0.200
2.00	2.00	2.00	2.00	0.200
2.00	3.00	2.00	2.00	0.400
2.00	3.00	2.00	2.00	0.100
2.00	3.00	2.00	2.00	0.100
1.00	3.00	2.00	2.00	0.050

1.15

1.00	2.00	2.00	2.00

2.00	3.00	2.00	2.00	0.10

0.30
------



Beckett Raeder	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>
0.300	0.200	0.200
0.600	0.400	0.400
0.200	0.200	0.200
0.600	0.400	0.400
0.150	0.100	0.100
0.150	0.100	0.100
0.150	0.100	0.100
2.15	1.50	1.50

0.40 0.40 0.40

0.15	0.10	0.10
0.55	0.50	0.50
2.70	2.00	2.00
3	2	2

Brenda Marcy

## **BLUE STAR TRAIL-NORTH SECTION EVALUATION OF ENGINEERING FIRM PROPOSALS TO SELECT TWO FINALISTS**

## Criteria Categories

	<b>Technical</b> - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs	
		Weight
1	Firm Experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years) Project leader experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects	10.0%
2	similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	20.0%
3	Landscape Arcitect experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	10.0%
4	Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants.	20.0%
5	Experience with multi-jurisdiction projects	5.0%
6	Traffic Engineer Experience	5.0%
7	Experience in workng with a Fire or Police Department in the design of a road or trail	5.0%
	Technical Weighting	75.0%
	<b>Management</b> - features or qualities of bidder as an organization (e.g., management approach, capacity to deliver, interest, finanacial capacity, business size & type, proprietary rights,	
	references of past performance)	Weight

	Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/construction, inspection/quality	
	control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC,	
8	communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc).	20.0%
	Familiarity and experience in project work in proximity to S-D, including working with MDOT and	
9	Allegan County Road Commission	5.0%

Management Weighting	25.0%
----------------------	-------

TOTAL SCORE	100.0%
-------------	--------

# Rank order 1-4 each Bidder against each criteria (1 is top rank).

If equal, use same sco	Weighted Score			
<u>C2AE</u>	<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>	<u>C2AE</u>
1.00	4.00	3.00	2.00	0.100
1.00	3.00	2.00	2.00	0.200
1.00	4.00	2.00	2.00	0.100
1.00	2.00	2.00	1.00	0.200
1.00	4.00	2.00	1.00	0.050
1.00	2.00	2.00	4.00	0.050
1.00	3.00	2.00	4.00	0.050

1.00	4.00	2.00	3.00	0.20
1.00	4.00	4.00	1.00	0.05

<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>
0.400	0.300	0.200
0.600	0.400	0.400
0.400	0.200	0.200
0.400	0.400	0.200
0.200	0.100	0.050
0.100	0.100	0.200
0.150	0.100	0.200
2.25	1.60	1.45

0.80	0.40	0.60
0.20	0.20	0.05
1.00	0.60	0.65
3.25	2.20	2.10

Cindy Osman

## **BLUE STAR TRAIL-NORTH SECTION EVALUATION OF ENGINEERING FIRM PROPOSALS TO SELECT TWO FINALISTS**

## Criteria Categories

	<b>Technical</b> - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs	
		Weight
1	Firm Experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years) Project leader experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects	10.0%
2	similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	20.0%
3	Landscape Arcitect experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	10.0%
4	Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants.	20.0%
5	Experience with multi-jurisdiction projects	5.0%
6	Traffic Engineer Experience	5.0%
7	Experience in workng with a Fire or Police Department in the design of a road or trail	5.0%
	Technical Weighting	75.0%
	Management - features or qualities of bidder as an organization (e.g., management approach, capacity to deliver, interest, finanacial capacity, business size & type, proprietary rights, references of past performance)	Weight

	Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/construction, inspection/quality	
	control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC,	
8	communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc).	20.0%
	Familiarity and experience in project work in proximity to S-D, including working with MDOT and	
9	Allegan County Road Commission	5.0%

Management Weighting	25.0%
----------------------	-------

TOTAL SCORE	100.0%
-------------	--------

# Rank order 1-4 each Bidder against each criteria (1 is top rank).

If equal, use same score; e.g. all equal score 1, 1, 1, 1; three are equal, 1, 2, 1, 1, etc.				Weighted Score
<u>C2AE</u>	<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>	<u>C2AE</u>
1.00	2.00	1.00	1.00	0.100
1.00	2.00	1.00	1.00	0.200
1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	0.100
1.00	2.00	1.00	1.00	0.200
1.00	2.00	2.00	1.00	0.050
1.00	4.00	1.00	1.00	0.050
1.00	2.00	2.00	1.00	0.050

1.00	2.00	1.00	1.00	0.20
1.00	3.00	2.00	1.00	0.05

<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	Moore Bruggink	<u>Wightman</u>
0.200	0.100	0.100
0.400	0.200	0.200
0.100	0.100	0.100
0.400	0.200	0.200
0.100	0.100	0.050
0.200	0.050	0.050
0.100	0.100	0.050
1.50	0.85	0.75

0.40	0.20	0.20
0.15	0.10	0.05
0.55	0.30	0.25
2.05	1.15	1.00

## Holly Leo BLUE STAR TRAIL-NORTH SECTION EVALUATION OF ENGINEERING FIRM PROPOSALS TO SELECT TWO FINALISTS

#### Criteria Categories

references of past performance)

	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs	
		Weight
1	Firm Experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	10.0%
2	Project leader experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	20.0%
3	Landscape Arcitect experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	10.0%
4	Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants.	20.0%
5	Experience with multi-jurisdiction projects	5.0%
6	Traffic Engineer Experience	5.0%
7	Experience in workng with a Fire or Police Department in the design of a road or trail	5.0%
	Technical Weighting	75.0%
	Management - features or qualities of bidder as an organization (e.g., management approach, capacity to deliver, interest, finanacial capacity, business size & type, proprietary rights,	

	Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/construction, inspection/quality	
	control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC,	
8	communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc).	20.0%
	Familiarity and experience in project work in proximity to S-D, including working with MDOT and	
9	Allegan County Road Commission	5.0%

Management Weighting	25.0%
----------------------	-------

TOTAL SCORE	100.0%
-------------	--------

# Rank order 1-4 each Bidder against each criteria (1 is top rank).

If equal, use same score; e.g. all equal score 1, 1, 1, 1; three are equal, 1, 2, 1, 1, etc.				Weighted Score
<u>C2AE</u>	<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>	<u>C2AE</u>
1.00	4.00	3.00	2.00	0.100
1.00	4.00	4.00	3.00	0.200
2.00	3.00	3.00	2.00	0.200
1.00	4.00	3.00	2.00	0.200
1.00	4.00	4.00	2.00	0.050
1.00	4.00	3.00	1.00	0.050
1.00	4.00	3.00	2.00	0.050

1.00	4.00	2.00	2.00	0.20
2.00	4.00	3.00	1.00	0.10

<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>
0.400	0.300	0.200
0.800	0.800	0.600
0.300	0.300	0.200
0.800	0.600	0.400
0.200	0.200	0.100
0.200	0.150	0.050
0.200	0.150	0.100
2.90	2.50	1.65

0.80	0.40	0.40
0.20	0.15	0.05
1.00	0.55	0.45
3.90	3.05	2.10

Ken Trester

## **BLUE STAR TRAIL-NORTH SECTION EVALUATION OF ENGINEERING FIRM PROPOSALS TO SELECT TWO FINALISTS**

#### **<u>Criteria Categories</u>**

	<b>Technical</b> - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs	
		Weight
1	Firm Experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years) Project leader experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects	10.0%
2	similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	20.0%
3	Landscape Arcitect experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	10.0%
4	Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants.	20.0%
5	Experience with multi-jurisdiction projects	5.0%
6	Traffic Engineer Experience	5.0%
7	Experience in workng with a Fire or Police Department in the design of a road or trail	5.0%
	Technical Weighting	75.0%
	<b>Management</b> - features or qualities of bidder as an organization (e.g., management approach, capacity to deliver, interest, finanacial capacity, business size & type, proprietary rights,	
	references of past performance)	Weight

	Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/construction, inspection/quality	
	control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC,	
8	communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc).	20.0%
	Familiarity and experience in project work in proximity to S-D, including working with MDOT and	
9	Allegan County Road Commission	5.0%

Management Weighting	25.0%
----------------------	-------

TOTAL SCORE	100.0%
-------------	--------

# Rank order 1-4 each Bidder against each criteria (1 is top rank).

If equal, use same score; e.g. all equal score 1, 1, 1, 1; three are equal, 1, 2, 1, 1, etc.				Weighted Score
<u>C2AE</u>	<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>	<u>C2AE</u>
1.00	2.00	1.00	1.00	0.100
1.00	1.00	1.00	4.00	0.200
1.00	1.00	4.00	1.00	0.100
1.00	3.00	1.00	2.00	0.200
1.00	4.00	2.00	1.00	0.050
4.00	4.00	3.00	4.00	0.200
1.00	4.00	4.00	2.00	0.050

1.00	1.00	2.00	2.00	0.20
1.00	3.00	3.00	1.00	0.05

<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	Moore Bruggink	<u>Wightman</u>
0.200	0.100	0.100
0.200	0.200	0.800
0.100	0.400	0.100
0.600	0.200	0.400
0.200	0.100	0.050
0.200	0.150	0.200
0.200	0.200	0.100
1.70	1.35	1.75

0.20	0.40	0.40
0.15	0.15	0.05
0.35	0.55	0.45
2.05	1.90	2.20

Rich LaBombard

## BLUE STAR TRAIL-NORTH SECTION EVALUATION OF ENGINEERING FIRM PROPOSALS TO SELECT TWO FINALISTS

#### **<u>Criteria Categories</u>**

	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs	
		Weight
1 2	Firm Experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years) Project leader experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	10.0% 20.0%
3	Landscape Arcitect experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	10.0%
4 5 6	Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants. Experience with multi-jurisdiction projects Traffic Engineer Experience	20.0% 5.0% 5.0%
7	Experience in workng with a Fire or Police Department in the design of a road or trail	5.0%
	Technical Weighting	75.0%
	<b>Management</b> - features or qualities of bidder as an organization (e.g., management approach, capacity to deliver, interest, finanacial capacity, business size & type, proprietary rights, references of past performance)	Weight

	Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/construction, inspection/quality	
	control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC,	
8	communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc).	20.0%
	Familiarity and experience in project work in proximity to S-D, including working with MDOT and	
9	Allegan County Road Commission	5.0%

Management Weighting	25.0%
----------------------	-------

TOTAL SCORE	100.0%
-------------	--------

Rank order 1-4 each Bidder against each criteria (1 is top rank).

If equal, use same score; e.g. all equal score 1, 1, 1, 1; three are equal, 1, 2, 1, 1, etc.			Weighted Score	
<u>C2AE</u>	<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>	<u>C2AE</u>
				7
				0.000
				0.000
				0.000
				0.000
				0.000
				0.000
				0.000
				0.000

		0.00
		0.00

0.00

<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>
0.000	0.000	0.000
0.000	0.000	0.000
0.000	0.000	0.000
0.000	0.000	0.000
0.000	0.000	0.000
0.000	0.000	0.000
0.000	0.000	0.000
0.00	0.00	0.00

0.00	0.00	0.00
0.00	0.00	0.00
0.00	0.00	0.00
0.00	0.00	0.00

## Joe Frey **BLUE STAR TRAIL-NORTH SECTION EVALUATION OF ENGINEERING FIRM PROPOSALS TO SELECT TWO FINALISTS**

# Criteria Categories

	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs	
		Weight
1 2	Firm Experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years) Project leader experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	10.0%
Ζ	similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	20.0%
3	Landscape Arcitect experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	10.0%
4	Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants.	20.0%
5	Experience with multi-jurisdiction projects	5.0%
6	Traffic Engineer Experience	5.0%
7	Experience in workng with a Fire or Police Department in the design of a road or trail	5.0%
	Technical Weighting	75.0%
	Management - features or qualities of bidder as an organization (e.g., management approach, capacity to deliver, interest, finanacial capacity, business size & type, proprietary rights, references of past performance)	Weight

	Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/construction, inspection/quality	
	control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC,	
8	communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc).	20.0%
	Familiarity and experience in project work in proximity to S-D, including working with MDOT and	
9	Allegan County Road Commission	5.0%

Management Weighting	25.0%
----------------------	-------

TOTAL SCORE	100.0%
-------------	--------

Rank order 1-4 each Bidder against each criteria (1 is top rank).

If equal, use same score; e.g. all equal score 1, 1, 1, 1; three are equal, 1, 2, 1, 1, etc.				Weighted Score
<u>C2AE</u>	<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>	<u>C2AE</u>
				7
				0.000
				0.000
				0.000
				0.000
				0.000
				0.000
				0.000
				0.000

		0.00
		0.00

0.00

<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>
0.000	0.000	0.000
0.000	0.000	0.000
0.000	0.000	0.000
0.000	0.000	0.000
0.000	0.000	0.000
0.000	0.000	0.000
0.000	0.000	0.000
0.00	0.00	0.00

0.00	0.00	0.00
0.00	0.00	0.00
0.00	0.00	0.00
0.00	0.00	0.00

Ryan Heise

## BLUE STAR TRAIL-NORTH SECTION EVALUATION OF ENGINEERING FIRM PROPOSALS TO SELECT TWO FINALISTS

### Criteria Categories

references of past performance)

	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs	
		Weight
1	Firm Experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years) Project leader experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects	10.0%
2	similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	20.0%
3	Landscape Arcitect experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	10.0%
4	Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants.	20.0%
5	Experience with multi-jurisdiction projects	5.0%
6	Traffic Engineer Experience	5.0%
7	Experience in workng with a Fire or Police Department in the design of a road or trail	5.0%
	Technical Weighting	75.0%
		/ 5.0/0
	Management - features or qualities of bidder as an organization (e.g., management approach,	
	capacity to deliver, interest, finanacial capacity, business size & type, proprietary rights,	

Weight

	Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/construction, inspection/quality	
	control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC,	
8	communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc).	20.0%
	Familiarity and experience in project work in proximity to S-D, including working with MDOT and	
9	Allegan County Road Commission	5.0%

Management Weighting	25.0%
----------------------	-------

TOTAL SCORE	100.0%
-------------	--------

Rank order 1-4 each Bidder against each criteria (1 is top rank).

If equal, use same score; e.g. all equal score 1, 1, 1, 1; three are equal, 1, 2, 1, 1, etc.				Weighted Score
<u>C2AE</u>	<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>	<u>C2AE</u>
				7
				0.000
				0.000
				0.000
				0.000
				0.000
				0.000
				0.000
				0.000

		0.00
		0.00

0.00

<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>
0.000	0.000	0.000
0.000	0.000	0.000
0.000	0.000	0.000
0.000	0.000	0.000
0.000	0.000	0.000
0.000	0.000	0.000
0.000	0.000	0.000
0.00	0.00	0.00

0.00	0.00	0.00
0.00	0.00	0.00
0.00	0.00	0.00
0.00	0.00	0.00

#### **Criteria Categories**

Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs

Firm Experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)

Project leader experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)

Landscape Arcitect experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)

Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants. Experience with multi-jurisdiction projects Traffic Engineer Experience

Experience in workng with a Fire or Police Department in the design of a road or trail

#### **Technical Weighting**

Management - features or qualities of bidder as an organization (e.g., management approach, capacity to deliver, interest, finanacial capacity, business size & type, proprietary rights, references of past performance)

Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/construction, inspection/quality control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC, communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc). Familiarity and experience in project work in proximity to S-D, including working with MDOT and

**Management Weighting** 

**TOTAL SCORE** 

Allegan County Road Commission

# Rank order 1-4 each Bidder against each criteria (1 is top rank). If equal, use same score; e.g. all equal score 1, 1, 1, 1; three are equa

Weight	<u>C2AE</u>	<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>
10.0%	1.00	4.00	3.00
20.0%	1.00	4.00	4.00
10.0%	2.00	3.00	4.00
20.0%	1.00	4.00	3.00
5.0%	1.00	4.00	4.00
5.0%	1.00	4.00	3.00
5.0%	1.00	4.00	3.00

75.0%

### Weight

20.0%	1.00	4.00	2.00
5.0%	2.00	4.00	2.00

25.0%

100.0%

ıl, 1, 2, 1, 1, etc.	Weighted Score		
<u>Wightman</u>	<u>C2AE</u>	<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>
2.00	0.100	0.400	0.300
3.00	0.200	0.800	0.800
3.00	0.200	0.300	0.400
5.00	0.200	0.000	0.100
3.00	0.200	0.800	0.600
3.00	0.050	0.200	0.200
4.00	0.050	0.200	0.150
3.00	0.050	0.200	0.150

0.85 2.90 2.60	0.85	2.90	2.60
----------------	------	------	------

2.00	0.20	0.80	0.40
1.00	0.10	0.20	0.10
	0.30	1.00	0.50
	1.15	3.90	3.10

<u>Wightman</u>	Notes/Questions
0.200	
0.600	
0.300	
0.600	
0.150	
0.200	
0.150	
2.20	

0.40	
0.05	
0.45	
2.65	

John Adams

## BLUE STAR TRAIL-NORTH SECTION EVALUATION OF ENGINEERING FIRM PROPOSALS TO SELECT TWO FINALISTS

#### **Criteria Categories**

	<b>Technical</b> - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs	
		Weight
1 2	Firm Experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years) Project leader experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	10.0% 20.0%
3	Landscape Arcitect experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	10.0%
4 5 6	Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants. Experience with multi-jurisdiction projects Traffic Engineer Experience	20.0% 5.0% 5.0%
7	Experience in workng with a Fire or Police Department in the design of a road or trail	5.0%
	Technical Weighting	75.0%
	Management - features or qualities of bidder as an organization (e.g., management approach, capacity to deliver, interest, finanacial capacity, business size & type, proprietary rights, references of past performance)	Weight

	Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/construction, inspection/quality	
	control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC,	
8	communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc).	20.0%
	Familiarity and experience in project work in proximity to S-D, including working with MDOT and	
9	Allegan County Road Commission	5.0%

Management Weighting	25.0%
----------------------	-------

TOTAL SCORE	100.0%
-------------	--------

# Rank order 1-4 each Bidder against each criteria (1 is top rank).

If equal, use same score; e.g. all equal score 1, 1, 1, 1; three are equal, 1, 2, 1, 1, etc. Wei				
<u>C2AE</u>	<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>	<u>C2AE</u>
1.00	4.00	3.00	2.00	0.100
2.00	4.00	3.00	2.00	0.400
1.00	3.00	3.00	1.00	0.100
2.00	4.00	3.00	2.00	0.400
1.00	4.00	3.00	2.00	0.050
1.00	4.00	3.00	2.00	0.050
1.00	4.00	3.00	2.00	0.050

1.00	3.00	2.00	2.00	0.20
2.00	4.00	3.00	1.00	0.10

0.30

<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	Moore Bruggink	<u>Wightman</u>
0.400	0.300	0.200
0.800	0.600	0.400
0.300	0.300	0.100
0.800	0.600	0.400
0.200	0.150	0.100
0.200	0.150	0.100
0.200	0.150	0.100
2.90	2.25	1.40

0.60	0.40	0.40
0.20	0.15	0.05
0.80	0.55	0.45
3.70	2.80	1.85

## **BLUE STAR TRAIL-NORTH SECTION EVALUATION OF ENGINEERING FIRM PROPOSALS TO SELECT TWO FINALISTS**

### **<u>Criteria Categories</u>**

	Technical - attributes or features of a product/service/provider based on customer's needs	
		Weight
1	Firm Experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years) Project leader experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects	10.0%
	similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	20.0%
	Landscape Arcitect experience in designing, building, and managing bike trails and/or other projects similar in scope (focus = last 5 years)	10.0%
	Experience with Grant Writing and working with MDOT and DNR in particular in obtaining grants.	20.0%
	Experience with multi-jurisdiction projects	5.0%
	Traffic Engineer Experience	5.0%
	Experience in workng with a Fire or Police Department in the design of a road or trail	5.0%
	Technical Weighting	75.0%
	<b>Management</b> - features or qualities of bidder as an organization (e.g., management approach, capacity to deliver, interest, finanacial capacity, business size & type, proprietary rights, references of past performance)	Weight
	references of past performance)	Weight

	Workplan (is it comprehensive including project planning, design/construction, inspection/quality	
	control, sub-contractor management, grant writing/management, project reporting with TCC,	
8	communications plan (key stakeholders), change management, etc).	20.0%
	Familiarity and experience in project work in proximity to S-D, including working with MDOT and	
9	Allegan County Road Commission	5.0%

Management Weighting	25.0%
----------------------	-------

TOTAL SCORE	100.0%
-------------	--------

# TCC SUMMARY - Firm Average of Raters by Criteria

### 1-Mar-21

### Rank order 1-4 each Bidder against each criteria (1 is top rank).

If equal, use same sco	Weighted Score			
<u>C2AE</u>	<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>	<u>C2AE</u>
1.00	3.13	2.13	1.75	0.10
1.13	2.88	2.25	2.50	0.23
1.38	2.25	2.50	1.63	0.14
1.25	3.00	2.00	1.75	0.25
1.13	3.38	2.50	1.63	0.06
1.75	3.38	2.38	2.38	0.09
1.00	3.25	2.63	2.25	0.05

ſ					
	1.00	2.63	1.75	1.88	0.20
	1.63	3.50	2.50	1.13	0.08

	0.28
	1.19
Rank Order	1 C2AE

<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>	
0.31	0.21	0.18	
0.58	0.45	0.50	
0.23	0.25	0.16	
0.60	0.40	0.35	
0.17	0.13	0.08	
0.17	0.12	0.12	
0.16	0.13	0.11	
2.21	1.69	1.50	

Notes	/Questions
NOLCS	Questions

0.53	0.35	0.38
0.18	0.13	0.06
0.70	0.48	0.43
2.91	2.16	1.93
2.01	2.120	1.50
4	3	2
Beckett Raeder	Wightman	

# BLUE STAR TRAIL-NORTH SECTION EVALUATION OF ENGINEERING FIRM PROPOSALS TO SELECT TWO FINALISTS

<u>TCC SUMMARY - Firm Averages by Rater</u>

1-Mar-21

<u>Rater</u>	<u>C2AE</u>	<u>Beckett Raeder</u>	<u>Moore Bruggink</u>	<u>Wightman</u>
Kathy	1.15	1.75	1.1	1.55
Jerry	1.45	2.7	2	2
Brenda	1	3.25	2.2	2.1
Cindy	1	2.05	1.15	1
Holly	1.15	3.9	3.05	2.1
Ken	1.15	2.05	1.9	2.2
RichD	1.15	3.9	3.1	2.65
John	1.45	3.7	2.8	1.85
8	1.19	2.91	2.16	1.93
Rank Order	1	4	3	2
	C2AE	Beckett Raeder	Moore Bruggink	Wightman